

**THE REGULAR MEETING
OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL OF BENSON, ARIZONA
HELD DECEMBER 11, 2017 AT 7:00 P.M.
AT CITY HALL, 120 W. 6TH STREET, BENSON, ARIZONA**

CALL TO ORDER:

Mayor King called the meeting to order at 7:11 p.m. with the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL:

Present were: Mayor Toney D. King, Sr., Vice Mayor Joe Konrad, Councilmembers Pat Boyle, Larry Dempster, David Lambert and Lori McGoffin. Absent was: Councilmember Levi Garner.

Mayor King stated Councilmember Garner notified the Mayor that he was ill and would not be in attendance.

EMPLOYEE RECOGNITION: Mayor King recognized Gordon Long for 25 years of service with the City of Benson.

PROCLAMATION: None

PUBLIC HEARING: None

CALL TO THE PUBLIC:

Mayor King stated there were approximately 25 people who signed up to address the Council during the Call to the Public and therefore, he was changing the allotted time to speak from 5 minutes to 3 minutes.

Ed Hubert, S. Country Club, Tucson, stated he wanted to commend the Council on the progress they had made on being able to use the annexed property that a prior City Council annexed into the City for El Dorado Holdings to be able to develop in a reasonable manner. Mr. Hubert then stated the Council's selection of a financial advisor was a prudent choice and at this time it would be good to move forward with as much as possible haste, to allow El Dorado Holdings to begin to develop Benson into the City he hopes it becomes. Mr. Hubert then stated he is a landowner in Benson with partners and he has a financial interest in seeing Benson prosper and succeed, then added he also has an emotional interest as he grew up in a small town and he considers Benson a small town. Mr. Hubert then stated he has found the will of the people is best expressed by action of the Council; then stated the action of the prior Council that caused the land to be annexed indicates the residents desire to see it developed into a manner that is both helpful to this part of the town and to the entire area. Mr. Hubert then stated he commends the Council for annexing the property, adding the Council didn't make the same mistake Tucson did 35 and 40 years ago when they did not annex property and those areas are now called Sahuarita, Oro Valley, Marana, and the County; then stated the Pima County doesn't even control property in the County. Mr. Hubert then stated he would he has a friend who has a saying that says, "Men plans, God laughs" and he thinks it should be changed to "Benson plans, God smiles."

Kevin Oberg, Tucson, stated he was here as a member of the Southeastern Arizona Economic Development Group (SAEDG) and a long-time participant in the community. Mr. Oberg stated he thinks the Council took the steps last week to set in motion what is the most powerful and necessary project that you have in front of you, which is the Villages of Vigneto. Mr. Oberg then stated he didn't think the Council should let Stifel interject themselves tonight and the Council should do everything they can to put the Villages of Vigneto and El Dorado in a position to move forward in the first quarter of next year.

Alain Hartman, Airport Road, Benson, stated he was a Benson native and was here to speak in support of the Vigneto project. Mr. Hartman then stated as a property tax consultant, he has seen the impact of a waning tax

base creating higher and higher taxes on locals, adding when the project takes off, every house that is built will increase the assessment base. Mr. Hartman then stated the target market for this project are primarily active seniors, so the development will not be a big burden on the school districts, adding school districts are a big part of property taxes. Mr. Hartman then stated by moving the project forward as soon as possible, there will be some much-needed taxation relief for a lot of the locals in terms of the impact he has seen on property taxes over the last few years. Mr. Hartman then stated new jobs will be helpful as well and the Council shouldn't delay anymore, but move forward.

Mark Kartchner, Bear Canyon, Tucson, stated he was probably the eldest Bensonite here, having been hatched in this area over 80 years ago. Mr. Kartchner then stated he has been interested in the area and has invested heavily in the area over the last 40 years, noting he hasn't been able to make a very large dent in the development of the area, due to various factors. Mr. Kartchner then stated he thinks a great opportunity is lying ahead in the Vigneto project. Mr. Kartchner then stated Benson's biggest export in the past has been the youth, due to lack of employment and hopefully, this will have a major influence in changing that. Mr. Kartchner then stated he would also like to point out that over the past 20+ years, there has only been one major development in the area: the complex at Interstate 10 and Highway 90, and more recently, Wal-Mart. Mr. Kartchner then stated in the past 10 years there has been no significant development and in the past 18 months or so, there have been 3 restaurants close, noting the Council now has the opportunity to move forward with this project. Mr. Kartchner then stated he is appalled at the number of people standing and raising roadblocks in the development of this project, adding many of whom are outsiders who have no vested interest in the welfare of Benson and are only interested in their own selfish self-interest. Mr. Kartchner then stated he would encourage the Council to look forward to the catalyst that Vigneto offers in progressing the development in Benson and the cultural, business and residential community of which it is capable.

Andrew Abernathy, S. Mesquite, Benson, stated as a resident of Benson for over 10 years and with ties to Cochise County since 1975 and to Arizona, since 1972, he is deeply concerned for the environmental and economical health of the community. Mr. Abernathy then stated, he was here to voice concern about the possible action on the agenda, adding he didn't know the background and how the item came to be, but he knows if it is approved; it can have disastrous consequences for all of us, including each one of the Council, as well. Mr. Abernathy then stated he was talking about Stifel, Nicolaus and Company being considered as an advisor for the formation of the special land based taxing districts for the purpose of financing the development, Villages at Vigneto. Mr. Abernathy stated the Council has already appointed and contracted with a financial advisor who is competent to advise the City on these matters and asked why the Council should consider an additional unnecessary financial burden with another consultant. Mr. Abernathy then asked if this was a power play by Stifel and some Councilmembers to inject themselves into a business that they really have no reason to be involved in. Mr. Abernathy then stated Stifel, Nicolaus and Company is an organization that has no local ties to the community as it is a Phoenix-based legal firm that has no interest in our welfare, adding they are only seeking a position of representation as a power play to disrupt a project they no longer have control over. Mr. Abernathy stated it's very likely a power play orchestrated by individuals who have had their personal pride and ego bruised, so they are seeking some sort of revenge at the City's expense, adding they really don't care who they harm, how much they harm them and they don't care who is going to come out on the other end. Mr. Abernathy then stated Stifel, the Audubon Society, the Center for Biological Diversity, the Sierra Club and other organizations like these are created to generate income for their private benefit, not for the benefit of local communities. Mr. Abernathy then stated none of these organizations will care about our livelihoods, families, schools or businesses after the vote tonight if they win. Mr. Abernathy then stated the Council should make no mistake that these organizations are largely made of urban dwellers who have an idolized view of rural America; then stated why 2 Councilmembers, Councilmember Lambert and Councilmember McGoffin, want to include these outside, non-invested, interloping parties in our business was beyond him. Mr. Abernathy then stated he would encourage the Council to not approve item number 3 on the agenda.

Kirsten Smith, E. El Sol, Benson, stated she was here to express her support for the Villages at Vigneto project, adding she hopes it is able to move forward from here on out. Ms. Smith stated she was invested in Benson as a small business owner, as a dedicated volunteer in the community and as a life-long resident. Ms.

Smith then stated she wants to stay in Benson, she wants her businesses to thrive in Benson and she wants her children to have something to come back to in Benson after they attend college. Ms. Smith then stated Benson needs a huge economic boost and more jobs, adding it needs this development to move forward. Ms. Smith then stated most importantly, she looks forward to the future of Benson and it is clear that the Villages at Vigneto is a huge contributor to that, adding the possibilities are endless with this project.

Lorene Whaley, S. Whaley Road, Benson stated she strongly supports the Villages at Vigneto and the City working with El Dorado to move the project forward. Ms. Whaley stated she is not a newcomer to Benson and has been here most of her life, adding she ran a restaurant her family started in 1936 and she feels she has a real vested interest in the community and in the project. Ms. Whaley then stated she certainly can speak from experience when she says small business owners struggle night and day just to make ends meet, adding business owners put their life, blood and savings into their businesses in most cases, just to make payroll. Ms. Whaley then stated small business owners provide jobs to people who otherwise wouldn't be able to put food on their tables or a roof over their heads. Ms. Whaley then stated it saddens her that she heard a comment that the dirty little secret of the young people in our area is that the best paying jobs in the valley are selling illegal drugs. Ms. Whaley then stated the school is finally building on education standards, but we will lose those people if we can't pay them well. Ms. Whaley then stated the future is bleak without some kind of development and she thinks the Villages at Vigneto is a beautiful development for the area. Ms. Whaley then stated she knows there has been concern about the water the Villages might use, but the developer has promised to build green and recharge the water. Ms. Whaley then stated she thinks people don't realize that if the Villages of Vigneto doesn't happen, the developer could, by real estate law, split all of the property into 40-acre parcels, then 8-acre parcels, then 4-acre parcels and we could end up with 3,000 lots and 3,000 straws into the aquifer and 3,000 septic tanks with no control. Ms. Whaley then stated she thinks everyone knows that business begets business and that we need the commercial development. Mayor King informed Ms. Whaley that she was out of time.

Barbara Nunn, E. La Cuesta, Benson, stated she was here 3 Council meetings ago and during the Call to the Public, everyone had to listen to a 3-minute infomercial from the illustrious radio station in town about his wonderful new coverage, what a great deal he would make for the City Council, how he wouldn't raise the rates and how they could be heard in Tucson. Ms. Nunn then stated after the meeting, she got into the truck, turned on the radio and the first thing she heard was the radio station owner talking filthy about the City and how the Council won't let him improve his station. Ms. Nunn then stated if the Council was crazy enough to spend a dime on the local radio station, they should all be shamboozled, adding she didn't think the Council should do anything crazy like that and spend City money on that vile station.

Anna Lands, stated she does not live in Benson, but she owns property in Benson and pays taxes in Benson. Have had a long connection with Benson. Ms. Lands then stated if memory serves, it was when the precursor to the Vigneto project was in process that the Benson City Council began making a distinction between city residents and non-, adding it was during this time that non-residents who expressed concern with the City's trajectory became subject to disparagement, and labeled "outsiders." Ms. Lands then stated she wished to address some reasons why non-residents might be concerned with what happens within the City of Benson, stating what happens to Benson happens to everyone, regardless of where they live in the watershed, adding they are all connected with the air they breathe, water they drink, the ground, the sky, and hopefully, the rain. Ms. Lands then stated air quality is problematic because of the north-south traffic, with I-10 running east and west and with the coal-burning trains leaving even more particulates in the air, noting it wasn't that she was against trains and they were probably better than a million trucks. Ms. Lands then stated where she lives, if the wind is just wrong, she can smell the air pollution of Phoenix and their water supply is already problematic because of lowering water tables all along the San Pedro. Ms. Lands then stated Benson's water quality could become problematic due to the significant presence of arsenic in city wells, in wells increasingly to the east and Arizona continues to experience drought. Ms. Lands then stated with no longer deniable climate change, weather patterns are losing their structure and even without the addition of a large city uphill, storm water management in Benson is a major issue. Ms. Lands then stated floodwaters don't stay in St. David and Benson; they flood Tres Alamos, Cascabel, Redington, San Manuel, Mammoth, Winkelman, and on into the Gila River. Ms. Lands then stated in the past, toxic chemicals have been released into the north-flowing San

Pedro, offering yet another example of the importance of the connections with one another and how what one neighbor does affects all other neighbors. Ms. Lands then stated light pollution is something most people don't think about, but Benson experiences "night glows" from Sierra Vista, Willcox, Tucson, and Safford; then added because Benson has its own night glow, residents are unlikely to be aware of them and they become part of the ambiance, as is the constant noise from I-10. Ms. Lands then stated she has some understanding of reasons for trying to exclude non-residents, adding they resemble reasons for gerrymandering and other forms of control of influence, but these are all attempts at an end run on democracy; the democracy each of the Council pledges at the beginning of each City Council meeting. Ms. Lands then stated she also want to add that many of the points people have had so far are well-taken and she can't say she disagrees with them, adding Benson's economy is important to her as well. Ms. Lands then stated probably one thing Council could do is to silence the trains, adding that would put her and many other shoppers on main street.

Tricia Gerrodette, Eagle Ridge Drive, Sierra Vista, stated although El Dorado has clearly rallied the troops to attend this meeting, she was here last week when not too many other people were for the special Council meeting at which the Council hired a firm that was supported by Ken Gukenberger, which is a firm that is supported by Mike Reinbold. Ms. Gerrodette then stated it was back in August that the Council had a presentation from Mark Reader of Stifel, who estimated at that time, when the contract was signed, that he would need about 100 hours to assess these 10 special taxing districts, which is the same estimate the 2 firms said last week. Ms. Gerrodette then stated she thought the Council was maybe getting a second opinion and she thinks that's a pretty good idea for something this big. Ms. Gerrodette then stated she thinks it's also clear that Mike Reinbold doesn't get along with Mark Reader, adding this is something known for months and hasn't been talked about. Ms. Gerrodette then stated she believes the Council talked about something like this in their executive session and she's here to chastise them for that, as the paper did last week, adding the reason she thinks she's justified in saying that is at last week's special Council meeting, the City Manager allowed as how he had been directed to search out another financial advisor firm when the City already had a contract with Stifel. Ms. Gerrodette then stated the Council now has 2 financial advisors and could make use of either one of them or both of them, but it seems pretty obvious to her that the Council took action after that executive session. Ms. Gerrodette then stated she believes Mayor King and Councilmember Dempster directed the City Manager to search out additional applicants, adding we heard from City Manager Bill Stephens how difficult the process for that was; how he got 1 out of a group of 3 that were acceptable to El Dorado, and how he then of course, had to have at least 1 more firm so it wouldn't look like a straight shot by an El Dorado approved firm and how he struggled to find one more applicant, but did. Ms. Gerrodette then stated that young man came down here from Tucson and he didn't get told the meeting had been delayed until 6:00 p.m. so he was here at 5:30. Ms. Gerrodette then stated she chatted with him and spoke with him as he exited the room, telling him she thought he would be making a presentation, adding he told her that he thought so too. Ms. Gerrodette then stated she thought the man was treated very shabbily and she thought the Council owed him an apology.

Councilmember Dempster asked if he could respond with City Attorney Gary Cohen stating Councilmember Dempster could respond at the end of the Call to the Public.

Lupe Diaz, S. Post Road, Benson, stated he has been in Benson since 1988 and moving to Benson was a culture shock to him because he moved from somewhat of a growing community to Benson before Denny's was here. Mr. Diaz then stated when Denny's came in the second year he was here, the whole community lined up and it was great to see that. Mr. Diaz then stated the Council had a tough job when Wal-Mart came in because everyone knew it was going to affect the whole community. Mr. Diaz then stated the Council has all put in a lot of work on this project already and he just wanted to say they've done a great job of doing it and bringing the project to this point. Mr. Diaz then stated one of the things he's looking at is why the Council should go ahead and put a hurdle in the middle of this by bringing Stifel in when the Council hired another firm they thought was reasonable in its price and was very qualified, adding he too, was present at the special Council meeting. Mr. Diaz then stated the move Council made at that meeting was like selecting a team that can work the best and he doesn't think voting yes on item 3 on the agenda would be putting the best team together. Mr. Diaz then stated he knows people talked about concerns, but the Council has come so far through this project and now it's almost at the finish line, adding it's where it needs that boost to be able to

cross the finish line, which also is the starting line. Mr. Diaz then stated he's in favor of the project and rather than going backward, the Council should go forward, adding everything is in place. Mr. Diaz then stated the Council hears the concern of the community and he is encouraging the Council to vote no on item 3. Mr. Diaz then stated there were concerns when Wal-Mart came in, but now the community is benefitting from that. Mr. Diaz then stated in the 1950s and '60s, there was a lot more the community had to offer to its citizens and the those surrounding the area, such as a drive-in, a skating rink and a theater and stated the activity now is nowhere near that. Mr. Diaz then stated he wanted to encourage the Council to move forward, not put a hurdle in the mix, should get the best team together and go ahead and move forward, adding he really supports them as a Council.

Rex Widman, N. Ocotillo, Benson, stated he was in support of the Villages at Vigneto for a couple of reasons; then stated he and his wife have an equestrian village north of town, he is a contractor and Rexcavating is the name of his company, and he is also pastor of the local San Pedro Cowboy church, adding he sees this on 3 different levels that this area can used what is being proposed. Mr. Widman then stated he wanted to talk about the people involved in it. Mr. Widman then stated the first project he ever did in Benson was the library foundation, adding he picked it because it was the library, and the people on that project told him they were going to save a tree at the library. Mr. Widman then stated when he heard that, he knew someone had a vision for saving a tree and he wanted to be a part of it. Mr. Widman then stated he had been part of Wal-Mart, noting he was privileged to do the foundation on Wal-Mart; then added he also worked with the people on the strip mall east of Wal-Mart and he worked on the remodeling project at the school. Mr. Widman then stated he worked on those 4 projects in what seems like the last 20 years; then stated he worked on 4 projects a day in Tucson. Mr. Widman then stated he did them with the people who are now asking if they could build this thing, adding one of them is the Diamondback stadium. Mr. Widman then stated in that project, the people said they were going to use recycled material, adding he started working with those people and they did a perfect job, adding they explained at the beginning of the project that it was all about the integrity of the project as it related to the foundation. Mr. Widman then stated if anyone goes up there now, they will see it's not just green because the fields are green, but because the foundation was literally built with reclaimed building materials, adding they used chunks of old cinderblocks, old bricks and things that people would have just thrown away. Mr. Widman then stated the people the Council is suggesting to build this project are people who have a very good solid foundation built on integrity. Mr. Widman stated he knows it because one of the people who gave him his first job when he was 15 years old is now one of the people who is going to be doing this. Mr. Widman stated the man got down on his hands and knees and taught him how to scrape sand, adding he built a career out of that. Mr. Widman said the man didn't have to do it, but he did, adding these people aren't just people who want to build buildings, these are people who want to build a community and life.

George Scott, W. 4th Street, stated he was here representing SAEDG and he's lived here his whole life also. Mr. Scott then stated as someone said earlier, Benson was a whole lot more prosperous in the '50s and '60s than it is today. Mr. Scott then stated the reason he was here was to address item 3 on the agenda, adding he was also here at the special when the Council hired a well-qualified person, Larry Given of Hilltop Securities to review these contracts and applications from El Dorado. Mr. Scott then stated as the Council may recall the vote to do was 6 in favor and 1 opposed, adding that should have settled the question on who was going to be the advisor on the applications, but now he found out last week that Councilmember Lambert didn't like the way the vote went and Councilmember Lambert wants to bring Stifel and Company back into this conversation. Mr. Scott then asked why the Council would want to risk this project and the future of the Villages at Vigneto by doing this, adding the City Attorney and the City Manager worked hard to find a good, well-qualified company that the Council could hire, which was done. Mr. Scott then asked if the City Council trusted their City Manager and City Attorney. Mr. Scott then stated it makes the community wonder if there is some kind of reward for the Councilperson that keeps pushing the Council to hire Stifel and Company. Mr. Scott then stated in the last few days, he polled the membership of SAEDG and other businesses in town, and they don't agree item 3 is in the best interest of the Villages at Vigneto project or the community of Benson, then asked the Council to please reject item 3.

David DiPeso, W. 4th Street, Benson, stated he was not resident of Benson, but has several businesses in Benson and owns property in Benson. Mr. DiPeso then stated in the essence of time, he would keep it as short as possible; then stated he thinks the points that have been brought out are all well-taken and should be considered. Mr. DiPeso then stated the Council has already hired someone to do this review, so they would be wasting the City's money if they hire someone else and they would be making waves that don't need to be made. Mr. DiPeso asked the Council to reject agenda item 3.

Mahlon MacKenzie, N. Mescal Road, Benson, stated he was a third-generation native of the community and he has been in business here since the '70s, adding his dad and grandad prior to that were also business owners in town. Mr. MacKenzie then stated he is active in volunteering, has been involved in a number of things and is currently working as the President of the Chamber of Commerce. Mr. MacKenzie then stated he would keep his comments short and asked the Council to keep moving forward; voting no on agenda item 3.

Jerry DeGrazia, N. Painted Quail Place, Tucson, stated he has a company with Harold Ashton that owns property here in Benson and obviously, they are interested in how things go. Mr. DeGrazia then stated before the meeting started, the radio station owner asked Mr. DeGrazia if his company was going to start doing something with their restaurant and their property, but Mr. DeGrazia said they wouldn't be doing anything until the Villages at Vigneto project starts. Mr. DeGrazia then stated when they do start, they will be bringing in people just like El Dorado has done. Mr. DeGrazia then stated the community needs to go forward and to sum it up, the community needs opportunities, jobs, keeping the kids in town and families, adding it's all positive. Mr. DeGrazia then stated there seems to be an overwhelming objective to get this thing going and the Council should move forward.

Cindy Allen, W. Flycatcher Lane, Benson, stated she is also a property owner of 253 E. 3rd Street, adding she and her husband purchased the old Arnold Hotel with the understanding that a new shot in the arm was coming to Benson. Ms. Allen then stated she and her husband are in total support of the Villages at Vigneto project. Ms. Allen then stated Benson has lost so many businesses and she and her husband are quite dismayed at the hurdles being thrown at the project, adding it upsets her ability to move forward and she strongly recommends the Council reject the proposal and just move on.

Regain Wilmarth, W. Rincon Peak Trail, Benson, stated she is a business owner here in Benson, adding in the last 3 years, Benson lost 24 businesses, which equals 8 businesses each year. Ms. Wilmarth then stated without the Villages at Vigneto moving forward, Benson looks to lose additional businesses throughout the year, adding a long-standing business, Spur Westernwear, also closed this year. Ms. Wilmarth then urged the Council to vote no, adding the town's integrity is on the line, noting the Council already hired someone and to withdraw at this point, makes the entire area wonder how business is done in Benson. Ms. Wilmarth then stated the Council not only represents the town, but they represent the businesses in town and the businesses' integrity as well. Ms. Wilmarth then again urged the Council to vote no.

Paul Lotsof, a non-resident and business owner of the CAVE FM radio station in Benson, stated he was the manager of the vile 97.7 FM in Benson and also 1201 AM in Tucson. Mr. Lotsof then stated it seems to him that every time he attends a Council meeting, more questions come up; then stated 6 evenings ago, Staff identified 2 companies that have expertise in special taxing districts and the bonds that those districts issue. Mr. Lotsof then stated the Council decided to enter into an agreement with Hilltop Securities and he can only wonder if Staff went out on their own and decided yet another bond consulting company was needed or if some sort of directive was issued to Staff, adding if it was, the question is when it was issued and exactly what did that directive request. Mr. Lotsof then stated the Council already has 2 firms under contract, with Kutak Rock and Stifel Nicolas who appear to have a wealth of expertise in special taxing districts; then asked why the Council would need a third consultant and what Hilltop could tell the Council that Mr. Gukenberger and Mr. Reader can't. Mr. Lotsof then asked why the Council needed to pay \$10,000 for a study and what the study might contain that can't be learned from Mr. Reader and Mr. Gukenberger. Mr. Lotsof then stated the City has had a long relationship with Mr. Reader, adding the decision to retain him for the Vigneto project dates back to the meeting of February 9, 2015, and his services were discussed in a meeting on January 31, 2015. Mr. Lotsof then stated on September 14 and October 12, 2015, the Council discussed Mr. Reader's role

and all seemed to be going smoothly, adding much more recently, on August 28 and August 29 of this year, Mr. Reader's role came up again and nothing negative about his services was disclosed. Mr. Lotsof then stated the obvious question is what is going on; then asked why there was a sudden need to bring in a third consultant on special taxing districts and what Mr. Givens brings to the table that Mr. Reader does not. Mr. Lotsof then stated during the special Council meeting, Councilmember Dempster said Hilltop would be paid by El Dorado, adding he recalls that Mr. Reinbold offered to pay Kutak Rock's fees, then asked when El Dorado agreed to pay Hilltop's fees. Mr. Lotsof then stated since the matter of Stifel Nicolaus is on the agenda, he would like the Council to fill everyone in on what is going on, adding he sees no benefit in keeping the public in the dark about items that could have widespread implications for the future of Benson.

Bill Vail, S. Country Club, Tucson, stated he was here in support of the Villages of Vigneto project and to have it move forward under El Dorado's leadership. Mr. Vail then stated he didn't believe there's any need for an additional advisor because the development being done was intended by the original annexation and the Council voted last week to move forward with a quality investment company, adding there's no need to be looking at hiring a second or having Stifel do that at this point. Mr. Vail then stated Benson will benefit from moving forward as quickly as possible, adding this has been going on for 4 years and he feels there should be a "no" vote on item 3 as he feels it will help this move forward and the City of Benson and Santa Cruz County will benefit.

Heather Taylor, Bonita, Benson, stated she is a business person here, running a restaurant and she believes this is a very good thing to come to Benson. Ms. Taylor then stated she supports the Villages at Vigneto and encourages this to go through.

Geoff Oldfather, J6, stated he is a second-generation Benson native, is a former Board member of SAEDG, and he lives and owns a home in J6 as well as owning a residential property at Cottonwood Bluffs Drive. Mr. Oldfather stated this means he gladly pay taxes in 2 school districts, adding the reason he mentions that is he wants to give the Council a couple of examples of what is at stake here if this doesn't occur. Mr. Oldfather then stated we can talk about numbers all we want but to really understand what is at stake here, people have to understand what is going on behind the scenes. Mr. Oldfather then stated he worked closely with the Benson School district 5 years ago when they went for their override and worked with them again and wrote an op-ed that was published in the Benson Newspaper in October in favor of the override extension. Mr. Oldfather then stated he has been in the schools quite a bit and all rural schools are struggling, adding without that override, which luckily passed, the school would have lost 11 jobs and would have lost a funding source that provides support up to \$100 per student for after school, extracurricular and sports activities. Mr. Oldfather then stated there is a lot at stake here, and asked if it wouldn't be nice if the school district had the revenue stream from the taxes this project will produce so that they didn't have to do these overrides; then stated not only would they not have jobs at stake, but they could add quality programs and quality teachers at our schools. Mr. Oldfather then stated he had one other specific example he wanted to give Council; then stated he has the privilege in his position of administering a program through the USDA called the Rural Economic Development Loans and Grant program (REDLG). Mr. Oldfather then stated the Benson Hospital last month opened and dedicated the Family Health Care center on main street and the Council may not be aware that the project was funded through the REDLG loan he administers through USDA through AZ G&T Cooperatives. Mr. Oldfather then stated the Benson Hospital could not get the funding for that project through conventional sources, because rural hospitals, like rural schools, are disadvantaged and don't have the revenue stream. Mr. Oldfather then stated he was able to make a \$100,000 simple interest 10-year loan at 3%, which is what made that project possible, adding it's a great program and he would love to make all the loans he can through that program for these kinds of projects. Mr. Oldfather then asked how great it would be if the hospital had the revenue created by the funding stream that projects like the development will create, so they didn't have to look for alternative forms of revenue and they could provide quality healthcare for areas where it's really needed. Mr. Oldfather then stated he wanted to leave the Council with one thought, stating 4 years ago, Arizona G&T commissioned a study, adding Dr Robert Carreria was involved to look at the economics of the areas they serve through their distribution cooperatives and it found that 1/3 of the people who live in our area, live at or below the federal poverty level, then asked the Council to please keep that in mind.

Mayor King stated he had a Councilmember who wanted to respond to a comment that was made at the Call to the Public.

Councilmember Dempster stated he was curious how Ms. Gerrodette knew what happened in the executive session and asked Ms. Gerrodette who told her or if she was just taking a shot. Councilmember Dempster then stated her comments when she said what Councilmember Dempster did were phony and wrong, so she was just taking a shot. Councilmember Dempster then stated there's one thing he would correct for Ms. Gerrodette, adding there's a difference between a financial advisor and an underwriter. Councilmember Dempster then stated the contract with Stifel was for an underwriter not a financial advisor, adding there's a very distinct difference and a legal difference. Councilmember Dempster then stated both Ms. Gerrodette and Mr. Lotsof, he thought, were confused and he hopes that helps them a little bit in understanding it. Councilmember Dempster then stated one company can't be both, adding it can be one or the other.

CITY MANAGER REPORT:

City Manager William Stephens addressed Council, giving the dates of upcoming meetings and events.

Monday, December 25, 2017 – Council Meeting – Cancelled, Christmas Day
Thursday, December 28, 2017 – Public Hearing, 7:00 p.m., City Hall
Special Council Meeting, 7:00 p.m., City Hall

Monday & Tuesday
December 25 & 26, 2017 – Christmas Holiday, City Offices Closed
Saturday, December 16, 2017 – Benson Christmas Festival – 10 a.m. – 4 p.m.
Vendors for Shopping, Entertainment, Food, and Children's Activities. As you know, have an agenda item tonight that will address a change that has occurred in the location from 4th Street to Huachuca Street.

Mayor King stated the Council wouldn't have another meeting until after Christmas and he would like to wish everyone a merry Christmas, asking those present to remember it's a special time of year and it's all about family, friends and those in need.

Councilmember Lambert stated the Council wouldn't have a regular meeting until next year, and he would like to let the public know that City offices will also be closed on January 1 and 2.

NEW BUSINESS:

1. Discussion and possible action on the Consent Agenda

- 1a. Minutes of the May 8, 2017 Regular Meeting
- 1b. Invoices processed for the period of November 20, 2017 through December 4, 2017

Councilmember McGoffin moved to approve the Consent Agenda. Seconded by Councilmember Lambert. Motion passed 6-0.

2. Presentation of the December 2, 2017 Festival of Lights – Light Parade float prizes for 1st, 2nd and 3rd place floats; prizes donated by Sulphur Springs Valley Electric Cooperatives

City Manager Bill Stephens stated the City held the Festival of Lights – Light Parade on December 2, followed by the Christmas Tree Lighting at City Hall, adding each year, the parade (and event) gets bigger and better and this year was no exception, noting there were 28 entries in the parade this year. Mr. Stephens then stated a big sponsor of the parade is SSVEC, adding not only do they provide the float Santa is on, but they also donate

gifts and cash to the 1st, 2nd and 3rd place floats as chosen by the judges. Mr. Stephens then stated this year, the prizes will be presented tonight and asked Mr. David Bryan to come before the Council.

Mayor King thanked Mr. David Bryan and Ms. Danna Judd. Mayor King then stated the parade was magnificent and he couldn't wait until it grows to 100 entries. Mayor King then stated 1st place was awarded to Pato Blanco RV park. Mr. Bryan and Ms. Judd awarded an electronic smoker. Mayor King then stated 2nd place was awarded to the 7th day Adventist Church, adding they won an electric turkey fryer and had already picked up their prize. Mayor King then stated the 3rd place winner was Milestone Automotive. Mr. Bryan and Ms. Judd awarded an electric turkey fryer.

Mayor King then thanked Mr. Bryan, Ms. Judd and SSVEC again for everything they do, adding the parade was amazing and it was a fun time for everyone who attended.

3. **Discussion and possible direction to staff regarding the City's use of Stifel, Nicolaus and Company, Inc. to review and advise the City on the special taxing district applications submitted by El Dorado Benson regarding the Vigneto Project**

City Manager Bill Stephens stated this item is on the agenda at the request of Councilmember Lambert and Councilmember McGoffin; then stated the City Clerk was getting the City's other attorney, Mr. Paul Loucks who was the land use attorney, on the phone for this issue. Mr. Stephens then stated the item being discussed was regarding the possible use of Stifel, Nicolaus and Company, Inc. to review the CFD (Community Facilities District) and RD (Revitalization District) applications with regards to special taxing districts.

Councilmember Lambert stated he would speak first and then open it up to Council for discussion, adding the reason he put this on the agenda was to get a second opinion. Councilmember Lambert then stated he knows the developer has approved anyone other than Stifel to do this and he is questioning why and wants to get a second opinion. Councilmember Lambert then thanked everyone for coming to the meeting and then stated he wanted everyone to understand that there are no hurdles, no roadblocks or anything else, adding the company hired last week is already reviewing these. Councilmember Lambert then stated the company approved by Council is in the process of doing their 14 days of review to get it back to Council to give the Council an idea of the financial side of this. Councilmember Lambert then stated all he was asking for at this point was for the Council to consider having Stifel, Nicolaus go ahead and look at it also. Councilmember Lambert then stated if both companies come back with the exact same report; then who's to say what the big deal is, but if they come back with two different reports, the Council can then look at the differences between the two and ask questions as to why. Councilmember Lambert then stated he was just trying to be open to the public, because the Council is here as an elected body for the public, not for themselves and he was not doing this for himself. Councilmember Lambert then stated everyone thinks he is trying to cause a big rift and cause a big problem, but he's not, adding he is just asking for Council consideration to have two different advisors. Councilmember Lambert then stated he knows the money given to the City by El Dorado, Inc. is set aside and while he's not sure exactly how much that is, he knows it's close to \$150,000 with their application fees. Councilmember Lambert then stated this money will pay for the any advisor the Council wants and is also to pay for the City Attorney that is actually working on this, adding all of these things need to come out of that fund that is set aside for the application fees. Councilmember Lambert then stated he's not trying to spend the public's money and is not trying to stop the project, adding no one is trying to do that; he's just trying to make sure the Council has all the advice from all the different advisors they can have so they can make a determination the right decision. Councilmember Lambert then stated if the public wanted to come up and say, "Mr. Lambert, just shut up, sit down and ride the boat like everyone else up here," he would be more than happy to just shut up and drop this off the agenda; then asked why and what everyone was trying to hide. Councilmember Lambert then stated he could address each person from the Call to the Public and talk about each item they talked about to include one item that Ms. Whaley brought up when she said business begets business. Councilmember Lambert then stated he agreed with that point, but when someone starts a business in this town, they don't actually go to the person who is selling the business to ask questions and get all the answers; they look at other people who have done the same business and ask what the repercussions could be and what someone had to lose if they put their whole soul, all of their investment and life into the business.

Mr. Loucks called for a point of order, adding the Council was getting a little off-track of the noticed agenda item to discuss the City's need for Stifel, Nicolaus. Councilmember Lambert then stated that was the reason he put the item on the agenda, adding he wanted to have Council consideration to possibly look at a second opinion. Councilmember Lambert then stated it could be Stifel, Nicolaus, or the other person who was at the Council meeting the other day, Ironwood, or anyone else so the Council could have two different reports to look at, so they could actually make sure they make the right decision, because once the Council makes the decision, there's no turning back.

Councilmember McGoffin then stated she actually talked to a few people at work and people who had come in and talked to her and they all wanted to know why the Council didn't use the advisor the City had on hand. Councilmember McGoffin then stated she explained that from what she was aware of, Vigneto was against Reader, which is why the Council had to look elsewhere. Councilmember McGoffin then stated she has no problem with the financial advisor the Council approved last week, but this project is the biggest thing the Council has going, adding there are times the current Council looks back at things done 20 years ago and then asks what past Councils were thinking. Councilmember McGoffin then stated like Councilmember Lambert said, the review has already been started and the Council is going to get that information, but she really didn't think it would hurt to have a second opinion, adding two reports have got to be better than one and the more information the Council has, the more educated the Council will be. Councilmember McGoffin then stated like Councilmember Dempster said, if the Council doesn't like the report, they don't have to listen to it; then stated that doesn't make a whole lot of sense to her, because she would want to find out why they didn't like it and why the reports didn't agree. Councilmember McGoffin then stated when someone gets diagnosed with cancer or they don't like the results of something, they're going to get a second opinion. Councilmember McGoffin then stated that way the Council could have two reports to look at, again adding more information is better. Councilmember McGoffin then stated like Councilmember Lambert, she doesn't care if the Council went with Stifel or even the person who was at the Council meeting last week, again stating she thought having two financial reports wouldn't hurt.

Councilmember Dempster stated he had three concerns and Mr. Loucks could possibly answer one of them; then stated there is a distinctive difference between a financial advisor and an underwriter, adding if he's not mistaken, the contracts with Stifel were for an underwriter with Mr. Loucks stating that was correct. Councilmember Dempster then stated the City doesn't have an agreement with Stifel as a financial advisor, so if the Council does this, he would suspect the Council would have to have a contract and would have to go through a process to establish a contract. Councilmember Dempster then stated his second concern is that the application fee from El Dorado does cover this, provided it's enough, but at this point, the Council doesn't have an accounting on what has been spent on attorneys, staff, etc. to process the applications, then asked if the expenses were at the limit, if Benson would have to pay for the additional expenses or if there was still money left so El Dorado would pay and the City wouldn't have to. Councilmember Dempster then stated this project is a billion dollar project; then stated he has been involved in trying to bring businesses to Benson for the last 20 years and if they got a \$100,000 project that was coming to Benson, they would celebrate. Councilmember Dempster then stated now we have a company that is going to bring \$200 million equity money into Benson right off the bat, in infrastructure, adding the bond money comes later. Councilmember Dempster then stated in this partnership arrangement, conceptually, there are 3 partners, Benson, El Dorado and maybe an underwriter, who is involved in the bonds, then noted there will be a lot of other smaller partnerships involved. Councilmember Dempster then stated El Dorado has said they don't want anything to do with Stifel, but they didn't say they didn't want anything to do with anyone else, adding they said they would take anyone else out the hundreds that are available. Councilmember Dempster then stated if El Dorado said they only wanted to deal with one, then he would think the Council would have some concerns, but El Dorado didn't say that, El Dorado said they would take anyone other than Stifel. Councilmember Dempster then stated a partnership, particularly on a \$1 billion project starting with \$200 million of equity money instead of debt, should be started with some sort of working relationship right off the bat. Councilmember Dempster then stated if El Dorado says they don't want Stifel, for whatever reason, but they'll take anyone else and the Council found some others that are qualified and the Council made a deal with them at the last meeting, to him, it's a pretty good thing. Councilmember Dempster then stated if the Council hires two firms, what's to

say they wouldn't hire three or four; then asked where it would stop. Councilmember Dempster then stated there is going to be a full financial analysis done before the bonds are going to be placed, so he's not concerned that there's great risk there, again stating there is a big chunk of equity money that goes in early and most failures that happen, if not all failures that happen, are due to not having equity money in the project; then stated he thinks that is huge in terms of the safety of the City.

Councilmember Boyle stated he was of the mind not to complicate the issue, adding he thinks Hilltop is probably fine, he is happy with decision Council made and he thinks they should stick with it.

Vice Mayor Konrad stated two words come to mind, "fiduciary duty" adding the Council signed on with Hilltop Securities as a financial advisor at the last Council meeting last meeting and part of Hilltop's responsibility to the City is fiduciary duty. Vice Mayor Konrad then stated Stifel's contract from August does not stipulate that Stifel has any fiduciary duty to the City of Benson, adding that raises a huge concern in his mind when it comes to a financial analysis and that it's unbiased in any way. Vice Mayor Konrad then stated he's not going to say anyone would be dishonest, but if someone stands to profit downstream from this transaction, there's a risk there in having someone who has a financial interest at the end of this rainbow. Vice Mayor Konrad then stated he believes the Council made a prudent decision based on good sound legal advice, he's happy with what the Council did, and that's where he stays.

Mayor King stated they asked Mr. Stephens and Mr. Loucks for an independent financial advisor to analyze the numbers in the CFD and RD applications, adding they did task them to find a financial advisor who would just do that. Mayor King then stated Mr. Stephens and Mr. Loucks worked extensively on this to identify qualified candidates, who they then vetted and interviewed, with Mr. Stephens confirming this was correct. Mayor King then stated he wanted to thank Mr. Stephens and Mr. Loucks for doing the job that they did. Mayor King then stated the Council had a special meeting last week to hire one of the qualified candidates to act as the City's financial advisor, adding the Council hired more than a qualified person, Larry Givens from Hilltop. Mayor King then stated Hilltop is a nationally recognized firm with a great reputation in this industry as a financial advisor and has done the largest majority of these things in Arizona. Mayor King then stated he doesn't understand why the Council wouldn't trust that and what he's done in the past. Mayor King then stated the vote at the last Council meeting did pass 6-1 and Mr. Given has already begun reviewing the application submitted to the City by El Dorado, adding the agenda item with Stifel, Nicolaus is unnecessary, but he now understands a little of what Councilmember Lambert and Councilmember McGoffin were explaining. Mayor King then stated in touching on what Councilmember Dempster said, the Council hasn't had a financial report, which he knows Mr. Stephens is working on, but he's concerned on how much money has been spent already; then asked Mr. Stephens to comment on that. Mr. Stephens stated the assessment of the City's budget and the execution of the budget is different than the actual funding that was provided in payment for the application review, adding none of that money has been spent and at this point, the City hasn't received any bills from any of the companies, so the full amount that was submitted remains. Mr. Stephens then stated the fee was \$15,000 per RD, \$15,000 only for the CFDs and \$25,000 given to the City two years ago by El Dorado to be used for legal review, which eventually will be used to pay Mr. Gukenberger for his legal review. Mr. Stephens then stated the total amount of money will be used across the board as the City goes through the process of reviewing the applications, adding all of that funding was specifically for RD and CFD applications, so it is different than the City's budget execution. Mr. Stephens then stated in order to determine the impact, for example, of the City Attorney's use of time to be involved in this process, it would have to be reviewed and it would have to be defined where the City Attorney's time was spent and if it was spent in the CFD or RD review process, adding it was, then it might be qualifiable to be refunded back to the General Fund, noting again, those funds were specifically for RD and CFD review.

Mayor King stated this is where his concern comes in, adding the Council doesn't know how much time the City has used or is going to use in the future. Mayor King then stated he thinks the Council needs to remove all the confusion on this, stick to who they hired last week and not spend any more money on this, adding the Council should let Hilltop do their job, which they are highly qualified to do, noting they are from Arizona and have done many of these in the state of Arizona. Mayor King then stated he thinks the Council needs to stay focused and doesn't need to throw thumbtacks down or poke anyone during the process, adding the Council

agreed to hire Hilltop and needs to stick to the decision. Mayor King then stated he meant no disrespect toward Councilmember Lambert or Councilmember McGoffin, but he thought the Council should stick to their decision.

Councilmember Lambert stated the information given to him by Councilmember Dempster regarding the fact that Stifel is not financial advisors, but are underwriters, is actually true, adding he looked at the application and it is true. Councilmember Lambert then stated in light of that information, he would like to withdraw his support for the item number 3.

Mayor King then moved to have the City Manager thank Stifel, Nicolaus and Company for what they have done for the City and say no to using them as a financial advisor on this agenda, adding with this being such a delicate situation, he also believes the City shouldn't use them in the future; then stated that was his motion.

Vice Mayor Konrad asked Mayor King to restate his motion.

Mayor King then stated he would like to move that the City Manager thank Stifel, Nicolaus and Company for what they have done for the City and to say no to using them as a financial advisor on this agenda item and to not using them on this development in the future. Seconded by Vice Mayor Konrad.

Vice Mayor Konrad then stated he did have one comment and asked if there were any billable hours the City was liable for at this point with Stifel that need to be squared up with Mr. Stephens stating there were. Vice Mayor Konrad asked when the Council could have an accounting of that with Mr. Stephens stating there were some technicalities in the actual Council-approved contract with Stifel, Nicolaus and he would have to discuss that with Mr. Loucks to determine the way forward, adding he doesn't have the contract terms memorized, but Stifel, Nicolaus has done work for the City so it may end up that the City will have to pay for those particular billable hours. Vice Mayor Konrad then asked if it would be fair to have that as an agenda item at the Council meeting on the 28th meeting, asking if that would be enough time to get the numbers to Council with Mr. Stephens stating if the Council was just looking for a report back in terms of numbers, he could probably do that without it being an agenda item. Vice Mayor Konrad then asked Mr. Stephens to please report on that as part of his report to Council with Mr. Stephens stated he would.

Councilmember Lambert stated he had a question, then stated in the motion, Mayor King moved to not use Stifel anymore for this project whatsoever, so basically, the Council is cancelling the contracts that the Council actually signed with Mayor King stating he did not move to cancel the contracts; he is just saying not to use them any longer. Councilmember Lambert then stated the seven contracts were for this project directly, then asked Mr. Stephens if they were or were not with Mr. Stephens stating Mr. Loucks or Mr. Cohen might have other information, but otherwise he believes the contracts were specific to the CFD/RD application review. Mr. Stephens then stated he also believes the Stifel, Nicolaus contracts, because they are a bond underwriter also allows them to, if selected by the CFD Board or whoever Council appoints, could then carry forward into the CFD district and become the bond underwriter.

Mayor King asked Mr. Loucks to weigh in on his motion with Mr. Loucks stating the contracts approved by the Mayor and Council back in August were specific to the CFD applications and RD applications that are currently pending for review, so both Vice Mayor Konrad and Mr. Stephens were correct. Mr. Loucks then stated the effect of the motion will be that Stifel will not be performing any further work. Mayor King asked if his motion was out of step with the agenda item. Vice Mayor Konrad then stated he believed Mayor King was asking if his motion was consistent with the agenda item with Mr. Loucks stating it was.

Mayor King then called for a vote and voted aye. Councilmember McGoffin stated she was voting nay, only because of the last line of the motion, adding she was ok with everything else except not using them in the future.

Motion passed 4-2 with Councilmember Lambert and Councilmember McGoffin voting nay.

4. **Discussion and Possible action regarding the Benson Clean and Beautiful and Benson Chamber of Commerce request for support for the Benson Christmas Festival, set for Saturday, December 16, 2017**

City Manager Bill Stephens asked if it would be permissible to allow Mr. Loucks to hang up and not be part of the remaining meeting, adding Mr. Cohen could remain on the phone for the rest of the meeting. Mayor King then thanked Mr. Loucks for attending via phone, adding he knows Mr. Loucks has been very busy.

City Manager Bill Stephens then stated at the Council meeting held on November 13, Benson Clean & Beautiful asked for sponsorship of the Benson Christmas Festival, adding at that time, they believed they would be allowed to hold the event on 4th Street and discussed the need for barricades. Mr. Stephens then stated Council approved \$2,000 for the support of the festival, but Benson Clean & Beautiful has since been notified by ADOT that the event must be held elsewhere, thus the barricades discussed at the meeting are no longer required. Mr. Stephens then stated Benson Clean & Beautiful has now asked to be on the agenda tonight to discuss and inform the Mayor and Council of the changes that have come to light regarding the Benson Christmas Festival and to clarify that the previously approved funding from the City, if authorized by Council, will be used for other festival expenses. Mr. Stephens then stated Ms. Cindy Allen and Ms. Reagan Wilmarth are here at the meeting tonight and Ms. Allen will address the Council and answer questions Council may have. Mr. Stephens then stated should the Council wish to sponsor the event, Staff would like to see a ratification of the previously approved funding via a motion and vote.

Ms. Allen then addressed Council stating she was representing Benson Clean & Beautiful and Regain Wilmarth representing the Benson Chamber. Ms. Allen then stated a failure in training of the ADOT permitting division has caused the Christmas Festival to be changed, adding at no time, since Ms. Wilmarth contacted ADOT in August about closing 4th Street was anything mentioned about ADOT being unable to close a state highway for commerce or a street fair. Ms. Allen then stated after two positive phone calls on December 1, the third call was from Olivian Moore denying the permit. Ms. Allen then stated there is no ARS statute referencing denial, but there is an administrative policy in force. Ms. Allen then stated Plan B was for a temporary event crosswalk allowing pedestrians to access the Visitor Center and events to be held there, which was approved by ADOT but deemed not feasible by City of Benson Police, then stated Plan C is closing Huachuca Street between 4th and 6th and the City will be assisting with barricades to close off 5th Street going east and west and the affected businesses' parking lots. Ms. Allen then stated on November 13, Ms. Wilmarth came before the honorable Council to request a sponsorship to assist in the great cost of barricades to close 4th, but in light of the permit denial, they will make good on their promise to return the City of Benson's \$2,000 sponsorship, if so desired. Ms. Allen then stated her question for Council tonight, is if they would continue to support the event with the \$2,000 that has already been received, adding the money will benefit not only their organizations, but it will enable them to continue our missions. Ms. Allen then stated Benson Clean & Beautiful will continue their mural project, which brings people in and the Chamber will continue its quest to bring in new businesses and commerce. Ms. Allen then stated these funds also allow them to continue their traditional events for the forthcoming years, such as Butterfield Stage Days, Christmas and any other events that they deem will bring in more people.

Mayor King stated he knows people who are waiting for this event, adding he thinks that since it is for the community and they host all the different events in the community, they should be able to keep the funding. Mayor King then stated the Council has given them support in the past with Ms. Allen confirming the funding was for events in Benson. Ms. Allen then stated the Council has sponsored events in the past, but because this funding was for a specific purpose, she wanted to come before Council and ask for the sponsorship to remain in place allowing them to continue hosting events.

Councilmember McGoffin stated the first funding request for this event was for barricades, but when the Council sponsored the Butterfield Rodeo, the funding wasn't for something specific and she was good with it being done that way, just as she is good with this.

Councilmember Dempster stated it was honorable that they offered to give the funding back to the City.

Councilmember Boyle stated the request was for a specific purpose and they were no longer using the money for that purpose, but being that it's Christmas, he couldn't say no.

Councilmember Lambert stated the Council has helped them and others in the past, adding he thinks it will be spent wisely. Councilmember Lambert then stated he knows the City Attorney has a hard time with these requests with Mr. Cohen stating the Council is aware of the issue. Councilmember Lambert then stated the issue is the gift clause, which addresses giving money without a getting back a tangible asset, but for the community, the asset is the community, adding this is giving back to the people who paid the taxes. Ms. Allen then noted the event is from 9:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.

Mayor King moved to allow the Benson Clean & Beautiful and the Chamber to keep the sponsorship. Seconded by Councilmember McGoffin. Motion passed 6-0.

DEPARTMENT REPORTS: No comments from Council.

ADJOURNMENT:

Mayor King wished those present a Merry Christmas. Vice Mayor Konrad then moved to adjourn at 8:44 p.m. Seconded by Councilmember McGoffin. Motion passed 6-0.

ATTEST:

Toney D. King, Sr., Mayor

Vicki L. Vivian, CMC, City Clerk